

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, March 10, 2008 Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

BOARD MEMBERS: MARK WIENKE, Chair

CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Vice-Chair

CLAY AURELL JIM BLAKELEY GARY MOSEL RANDY MUDGE DAWN SHERRY PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO PLANNING COMMISSION BRUCE BARTLETT

LIAISON:

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor

MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

3:00 P.M.

		website. www.suntabarbaraCa.gov
		ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST
		(See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)
CONCEPT	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street)
REVIEW		Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas &
		neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.
		<u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.
		Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations - (Include on first drawing)
		Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages,
		building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping.
		Include footprints of adjacent structures.
		Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.
		<u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.
		Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However,
		more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY	Required	Same as above with the following additions:
REVIEW		<u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.
		Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.
		Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary
		planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.
		Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.
		Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL &	Required	Same as above with the following additions:
CONSENT		Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.
		Cut Sheets - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.
		Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.
		Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.
		Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

NOTICE:

- 1. That on March 06, 2008 at 3:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
- 2. The ABR meeting will be broadcast live and archived on the internet at www.santabarbaraca.gov and televised live on Channel 18 and rebroadcast the following Wednesday morning at 8:00 a.m.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Call to order.

The meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Wienke.

B. Roll call.

Present: Aurell (arrived at 3:05), Blakeley (left at 8:59, Mosel (arrived at 3:15), Mudge (arrived 4:30,

left at 5:44), Sherry, Zink, Manson-Hing, Wienke

Absent: None

Staff present: Bedard, Limon (left at 5:44), Shafer

C. Public Comment:

No public comment.

D. Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of February 25, 2008.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of February 25, 2008.

Action: Manson-Hing/Sherry, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Mudge absent.)

E. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of March 3, 2008, reviewed by Christopher

Manson-Hing.

Action: Mosel/Blakeley, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Mudge absent.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of March 10, 2008, reviewed by Christopher Manson-Hing.

Action: Manson-Hing/Mosel, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Mudge absent.)

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- 1) Kirk Gradin, Architect, invited the ABR to a discussion by Stephanos Polyzoides, Architect and Educator, Saturday, March 15, 10:30 a.m., at Victoria Theater.
- 2) Member Zink announced that he would step down from Item 7, 1015 San Andres.

- 3) Chair Wienke announced that he would step down from Item 3, 350 Hitchcock Way.
- 4) Chair Wienke expressed condolences for Bill Cooper, Architect, who passed away on Saturday, March 3, 2008.

G. Subcommittee Reports.

Member Zink reported that the Sign Committee reviewed signage for Atlantic Air, 404 William Moffett Place. The site photos revealed a conflict between signage and location of the proposed palm trees. Mr. Zink suggested that the Board take into consideration not only tree placement locations, but also potential signage location when reviewing projects.

H. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No reported violations.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 618 SAN PASCUAL ST R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-102-023 Application Number: MST2008-00059

Owner: Habitat For Humanity
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposal to construct four two-story attached residential condominium units on an existing 6,250 square foot vacant lot in the R-3 Zone. The proposed units will be offered to low and very low income residents. The proposal includes 1 one-bedroom unit and 3 two-bedroom units to range in size from 737 square feet to 1,120 square feet. Proposed parking will be provided by four one-car garages. The proposal also includes 1,211 square feet of common open space and 634 square feet of private outdoor living space. Total on-site proposed development would be 4,691 square feet on a 6,250 square foot lot. The project requires review by the Staff Hearing officer for a Tentative Subdivision Map and requested modifications.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND REVIEW BY THE STAFF HEARING OFFICER FOR A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND MODIFICATIONS.)

(Time: 3:35)

Present: Peikert Detlev and Lisa Plowman, Peikert Architects; Joyce McCullaugh, Executive Director, and Christine Garvey, Habitate for Humanity.

Public comment opened at 4:04 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:05 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and return to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board finds: a) the street front massing is appropriate; b) the site diagram and planning are well handled; c) the front wall trellis as shown and described as "nitch with bench and trellis" is appropriate.
- 2) There is concern with the amount of grading and retaining walls, particularly in relation to the neighbor at the north property line. Mitigate with landscaping, and reduced grading.
- 3) Property line plaster walls should be finished on both sides, particularly adjacent to the neighboring properties.
- 4) The Board understands the existing 24 inch wide pittosporum trees may be in poor health.
- 5) The front walls abutting the sidewalk should be stone to match the neighbor.
- 6) The right front retaining wall as faced from the street appears out of character. The Board prefers the alternative offered by the applicant to either step the grading and/or step the planters.
- 7) Provide a more integrated entry at the stairs to Unit 4, which is located above the garages. Provide additional landscaping and an entry stoop.
- 8) Overall the size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site. The Board is reticent to comment on the reduction in parking and the requested bonus density as they may be out of the Board's jurisdiction.
- 9) The 5 foot side yard setback requested for the Unit 4 garage at the rear of the site does not pose a negative aesthetic impact.
- 10) Vine pockets on the driveway north side wall/retaining wall portion acceptable.
- 11) Provide a front entry from the street for Unit 1, to be more compatible with the neighborhood.
- 12) Provide additional detailing of the front facade, including window boxes and other features to provide animation.

Action: Blakeley/Manson-Hing, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Zink abstained. Mudge absent.)

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 4:35 P.M. UNTIL 4:38 P.M.***

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

2. 601 E ANAPAMU ST R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-142-019 Application Number: MST2007-00190 Owner: FAEC Holdings 390026, LLC

Applicant: Karen Quinn

(Proposal for a new site and landscape improvements consisting of new walkways, retaining walls, stairs, minor pool work, and installation of planting and trees to replace the removed trees. The work will abate violations per ENF2007-0000.)

(Review required by City Council Appeal Hearing held on 1/29/08.)

(Time: 4:44)

Present: Katy O'Riley-Rogers, Landscape Architect; Bob Kooyman, Property Manager, Meridian Group; Karen Quinn, Meridian Group.

Public comment opened at 4:55 p.m.

- 1) Sharon Summer: appreciates the improved landscaping plan; concerned about carport coverage; prefers saving the canary island plan.
- 2) Julie Wood: the landscaping plan is an improvement; hopes to see on plans what was stipulated by City Council, buildings shielded along Salsipuedes.
- 3) Ray Choiniere: hopes the palm trees can be saved; concerned about monitoring.
- 4) Barbara Bertram: requests the building owner replace mature trees with mature trees.
- 5) Cherry Rae: addressed unpermitted trash enclosure; hitching post; bull dozing of the historic stone wall; trash enclosure; parkway planting.

Public comment closed at 5:14 p.m.

Public comment reopened:

Cherry Rae, the neighbors in attendance are comfortable with the changes.

Sharon Summer, the amount of projected growth is doubtful, but overall happy with the changes. Public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval of the Review After Final with the following comments:

- 1) The applicant appears to have addressed all City Council comments.
- 2) Show trash enclosure screening at the north carport parking area, and show a 15-gallon Eucalyptus ficifolia (red-flowering gum) tree in that area.
- 3) At the north property area, adjacent to Building D, enlarge the planter as a trapizoidal shape on the parking and move the proposed Euclyptus sideroxylon (red ironbark) tree further from the building as appropriate.
- 4) Upon completion of the landscaping, the landscape architect of record shall submit a verification letter stating that the project is in compliance with the plan approved by the ABR.
- 5) The Board would like the applicant, one year after planting, to have the city arborist or a third party arborist verify that the planted trees are healthy and continue to be per approved plans.
- 6) The Board is happy that the applicant has agreed to put stone wall along Salsipuedes Street, improving conditions where they were previously unhealthy, and preserving a number of the existing large palm trees as part of the design.
- 7) As proposed, the stone steps are acceptable.

Action: Mudge/Sherry, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:45 P.M. TO 6:05 P.M.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

3. 350 HITCHCOCK WAY E-3/PD/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-003 Application Number: MST2007-00613

Owner: Clayton, Troutt and Company III, LL

Owner: Ralph Horowitz

Architect: Cearnal, Andrulaitis LLP

(Proposal to construct a 3,386 square foot one-story addition to an existing automobile dealership building. The project scope includes the demolition of 1,850 square feet of existing service bays and an enclosed area and interior and exterior remodel to the building that includes a facade remodel, reconstruction of service bays and a new 2,100 square foot canopy structure. Development Plan Approval findings are required at ABR for the new addition of 1,486 square feet.) (Second Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS BY THE ABR.)

(Time: 6:05)

Present: Brian Gibbons, Project Manager; Dave Humphreys, Architect; Mark Sacks, Tenant, Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect.

Public comment was opened at 6:32 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Provide accurately scaled drawings of the proposal.
- 2) Study an alternative solution to the top of the parapet wall.
- 3) Continue striving for simplicity and purity in the design.
- 4) The landscape is going in right direction.
- 5) Return with specifications for any proposed changes to exterior lighting.
- 6) A majority of the Board feels the improvements to the adjacent building to the north would not be required to be made as a part of the proposal; however, additional photo documentation and composite elevations of the building to the north are requested.
- 7) The Board is receptive to a varied color scheme as presented, and looks forward to the applicant illustrating where colors will be utilized. The Board would like to see color distinction between the rear garage doors to the wall color of the rear building.
- 8) The Board applauds the applicant's revisions to address noise concern to neighbors to the east.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mudge absent. Wienke stepped down.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 1820 DE LA VINA ST R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-022-022 Application Number: MST2007-00590 Owner: Mark and Val Maldonado

Applicant: Peikert Group

Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Concept Review of proposed future demolition of five existing residential units and construction of 10 to 14 condominium units. Three lots would be merged for a total site area of approximately 27,000 square feet. The exact scope of the proposed project has not yet been determined. The project requires review by the Planning Commission for a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION REVIEW.)

(Time: 7:06)

Present: Detliv Piekert, Architect; Gordon Brewer, Architect; Lisa Plowman, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:26 p.m.

Three public comment letters from Keri Dickerson and Laura Sullivan, and Paula Westbury were read into the record by Chair Wienke.

Scott Thomas:

Katherine Starr, opposed to number of condos and height of proposed project.

Public comment closed at 7:35 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates preservation of the oak tree.
- 2) Below grade parking is a positive idea given the site size.
- 3) The pedestrian oriented site plan with courtyard is good. The north driveway adds more light, air, and distance to the neighbors; the different style is acceptable in neighborhood.
- 4) Provide more trees on the north property line in the planter area of the driveway.
- 5) The south elevation appears needs to be broken up.
- 6) The alley at northern end between back unit and front appears too narrow.
- 7) Study ways of mitigating the third story look from the driveway.
- 8) Consider not having roof decks on all units, make sure decks do not loom over neighboring properties.
- 9) The front unit, at the south side, is possibly too tall, study reducing.
- 10) Provide exterior elevations and site plans showing adjacent neighbors structures.
- 11) There is concern with too many cantilevers on portions of the structure.
- 12) Incorporate some of the second stories into the roof element, and reduce the amount of third stories.

Action: Zink/Blakeley, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Mudge absent.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

5. 403 E MONTECITO ST M-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-343-010 Application Number: MST2007-00645

Owner: Richard Spann

Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal for multiple broadcasting antennas for an emergency radio station to be mounted on the north side of the existing three-story commercial building. The total height of the proposed antennas will be 12 feet and will extend approximately 5 feet off the building. It will occur at 22 feet above the base of the existing unit and will not project beyond the existing roof line. The project does not propose any architectural changes to the existing commercial building.)

(Final Approval may be granted.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES FINDINGS OF NO SIGNIFICANT VISUAL IMPACTS.)

(Time: 8:02)

Present: Adelle Goggia, Project Architect.

Public comment opened at 8:08 p.m. A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was read. Public comment closed at 8:09 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The Board would prefer the balcony to be smaller in width, centered under the window, and to not engage into the existing cantilevered elements.
- 2) Provide a lattice style flooring system to the balcony floor to hide the antenna view from below.
- 3) The board believes the generator does not need a flue. If a flue is needed, it is to be incorporate into the interior, and reviewed on Consent Calendar.
- 4) The Board found the project provides no adverse visual impacts.

Action: Sherry/Manson-Hing, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Mudge absent.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

6. 119 SKYLINE CIR E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-171-008 Application Number: MST2006-00522

Owner: Marc Tappeiner
Architect: Shubin and Donaldson

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,356 square foot two-story single-family residence and carport and construct a 2,944 square foot three-story single-family residence including a 699 square foot basement and attached 445 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes 420 cubic yards of grading inside the building footprint, and 120 cubic yards elsewhere on the 4,776 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The below-grade basement and garage allows a reduction in the FAR calculation for a total square footage of 2,595 which is 99% of the maximum FAR.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 047-07.)

(Time: 8:15)

Present: Allen McCloud, Project Architect; Kevin Moore, Project Manager; Marc Tappeiner, Owner.

Public comment opened at 8:30 p.m. Robert Potter, opposed: concerned about setbacks, balcony at the north, requested that Board consider their previous comments. Public comment closed at 8:38 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval with return to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The Board suggests different between color of concrete and aluminum perforated panels, as they may be too close in color.
- 2) Provide a color and materials board.
- 3) Provide a sample of perforated color panels in larger detail; show the color chosen behind the panel as it may show through.
- 4) Show the windows behind the perforated panels (page A-301).

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 5/0/2. Motion carried. (Manson Hing and Zink abstained. Mudge absent.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

7. 1015 SAN ANDRES ST R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-242-011 Application Number: MST2006-00438

Designer: Carlos Amaro

Owner: The Rodriguez and Espinosa Family Trust

(Proposal to demolish the existing 1,581 square foot single-family residence and detached two car garage and construct a new 4,905 square foot two-story duplex on an 8,000 square foot lot. Unit one is proposed to be 1,728 square feet and a 457 square foot attached two-car garage. Unit two is proposed to be 2,289 square feet and a 431 square foot attached two-car garage.) (Preliminary Approval is requested.)

(Time: 8:59)

Present: Carlos Amaro, Designer.

Public comment opened at 9:07 p.m. Julie Vior, opposed: the south side balconies will provide no privacy to adjacent properties. Public comment closed at 9:14 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Provide a planting strip at the south driveway property line, and introduce more trees along that edge to screen the neighboring property from the second story balcony.
- 2) Applicant to make the following exterior detail corrections: a) at the south elevation, eliminate the plant-on "hat shaped" form, and simplified to nothing or a simple wainscot band; b) reduce or eliminate the flared wall buttress between the garages to simplify that area.
- 3) Front elevation: the Board suggests restudying the shed roof at the left of the front door.

Possibly using an 8 foot plate rather than an 9 foot plate to better overlap the roofing form in that location.

- 4) Coordinate plans and elevation views on all portions of the building, including the front entry area, where the front porch has a return wall to the Dining room.
- 5) North elevation: at the center of the front unit, it is suggested continuing the shed across at the storage room. Restudy the stairway roof to be a shed roof in order to minimize massing on that elevation.
- 6) The Board appreciates the one story roof portion over the rear two-car garage as it helps reduce the building scale, and suggests that it be lowered to a 9 foot plate.
- 7) Provide a color drawing of the two tones proposed for the building. The Board suggests a stronger differentiation between concrete and aluminum panels.

Action: Mosel/Aurell, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink stepped down. Blakeley, and Mudge absent.)

I. Adjournment.

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 9:39 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 3825 STATE ST E-149

C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-014
Application Number: MST2006-00691
Owner: Macerich La Cumbre, LLC

Designer: The Conceptual Motion Company

Business Name: Marmalade Designer: Susan Ciufo

(Proposal for the interior demolition of an existing restaurant and for exterior alterations to include a new awning, new wall fountain, facade remodel, new arcade patio with outdoor restaurant seating and associated rooftop equipment at the existing Red Robin Restaurant at the La Cumbre Plaza. The new tenant will be the Marmalade Cafe.)

(Review After Final for proposed changes to windows and lighting, and new awnings.)

Public comment: A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval of the Review After Final with the following conditions: 1) At the west elevation: a) lower the proposed planter box at least 12 inches below window sill height; b) balance vine pockets to the left of fountain; c) keep the fountain spout; d) No awning; keep opening plaster trim; keep both (2) vine pockets. 2) Change from ceiling fans to pendant lights in loggia is approved. 3) North elevation: addition temporary awning is approved. 4) Color change from "weathered coral" to Benjamin Moore "Adobe Beige" is approved. 5) New awning at arched entry is approved.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD

B. 533 W GUTIERREZ ST R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-222-003 Application Number: MST2004-00264 Owner: Gonzalez Family Trust

Architect: Jose Esparza

(This is a revised project with original ABR approval on February 13, 2006. Proposal for a new second-floor 552 square foot addition to Unit D of a five unit apartment complex. The project involves a first-floor remodel area of 175 square feet to remove one downstairs bedroom and the addition of two bedrooms and two bathrooms on the second floor. The proposal changes the floor plan from a two-bedroom 851 square foot one-story unit to a three-bedroom 1,403 square foot two-story unit.)

(Final Approval is requested of the Review After Final.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final with the condition that Unit D covered entry is to extend to the northwest for greater wayfinding and visibility.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

C. 819 N SALSIPUEDES ST R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-031-008 Application Number: MST2006-00013

Owner: Webster Elaine Architect: Ron Sorgman

(Proposal to construct two new single-family residences on a 6,750 square foot lot. The project consists of a new 735 square foot one-story residence and attached 715 square foot two-car carport on the front of the lot and a 1,411 square foot, two-story residence on the rear of the lot. The project includes demolishing the existing 845 square foot one-story front residence and the 867 square foot one-story rear residence [total demolition of 1,712 square feet]. A modification is requested to allow the reduction of one required parking space and the encroachment of a parking space in the interior yard setback.)

(Review After Final for minor changes to door and entry stairs location for unit A; and stair rail, roof, and two windows for unit B.)

Continued one week.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Christopher Mason-Hing.. Consent Calendar ended at 2:10 p.m.